

December 8, 2014

TO: Snake River Recovery Planning Coordination Group

FROM: Rick Mogren

SUBJECT: Coordination Group Meeting Notes: November 12, 2014

**Introduction:**

A meeting of the Snake River Recovery Planning Coordination Group (Coordination Group) convened at 9:30 am (Mountain) in IDFG's Trophy Room, 600 South Walnut, Boise, Idaho on Wednesday, November 12, 2014.

Group participants consisted of representatives from tribes, states, and federal agencies, along with several non-government participants. Attachment 1 provides an alphabetical list of participants, member affiliation, and contact information.

These notes present the general nature of the topics presented, a summary of questions and discussion as raised through each portion of the meeting, and next steps. They do not represent a verbatim transcript of the conversation.

Copies of these meeting summary notes, presentation slides, draft recovery plan documents, and fact sheets used at the meeting are available on NOAA's Snake River recovery planning website at:

[http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/protected\\_species/salmon\\_steelhead/recovery\\_planning\\_and\\_implementation/snake\\_river/current\\_snake\\_river\\_recovery\\_plan\\_documents.html](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/protected_species/salmon_steelhead/recovery_planning_and_implementation/snake_river/current_snake_river_recovery_plan_documents.html)

**Opening Comments:** (David Mabe)

- Please refer to PowerPoint presentation: "Mabe – Snake River Recovery Plan Overview."
  - David reviewed the architecture of the approach and structure of Snake River recovery plans, noting that the four modules are designed to help address the entire life cycle of each species.
  - The 60-day comment period for the proposed Snake River Sockeye Recovery Plan is complete (see notes below). Responses to comments are being written, with revisions to the Plan being made as appropriate. NOAA expects to post the final Plan to its website and notice it in the Federal Register in early 2015.
  - The Fall Chinook Draft Plan is near completion (see notes below).
  - The SE Washington and NE Oregon Management Unit Plans for the draft Spring/Summer Chinook and Steelhead Recovery Plan are available in draft form. The Idaho Management Unit Plan and "Roll-up" Plan are near completion (see notes below).
  - NOAA will keep Coordination Group members notified as additional recovery plan-related products are uploaded to its website.

SUBJECT: Coordination Group Meeting Notes: 11-12-14

- David shared updated adult return run numbers for Lower Granite Dam for Snake River Spring/Summer Chinook, Sockeye, Coho, and Steelhead (refer to PowerPoint presentation: “NOAA – 2014 Returns”).

**Fall Chinook Plan** (Elizabeth Gaar):

- Please refer to PowerPoint presentation, “Gaar – SR Fall Chinook update 11\_11\_14 (2)”
- Columbia River tribes are presently reviewing a discussion draft Fall Chinook Recovery Plan. A draft for distribution to other co-managers and federal agencies is expected by the end of December 2014. NOAA hopes for a 30-day review period of the discussion draft, although Oregon and Idaho indicated they may require more time to work on key issues.
- New chapters will include “Recovery Goals and Delisting,” “Status Assessment,” “RM&E Framework,” and “Implementation and Coordination.” Work on the “Cost Estimates” chapter is ongoing.
- The revised date for noticing the proposed Fall Chinook Recovery Plan in the Federal Register is February 2015. However, this is likely to slip based on the discussion at the meeting.
- The Fall Chinook Recovery Plan is unique in that the Snake River Fall Chinook ESU consists of only one major population group which, in turn, has only one existing population. The other two historic populations are presently extirpated. If we were to de list with just one population, NOAA would need a high degree of confidence that the population is at a very low risk that the Fall Chinook Plan will meet its objectives.
- The discussion draft Fall Chinook Recovery Plan includes three potential alternative viability scenarios. NOAA suggests that all three of these scenarios be pursued through 2018. A description of each scenario is found in the meeting slides.
- Issues pertaining to the relationship between viability and supplementation programs were discussed. This issue is addressed in detail in the forthcoming recovery plan.

**Proposed Sockeye Plan** (Rosemary Furfey / Paul Kline):

- Please refer to PowerPoint presentations, “Furfey – SRCG Meeting SR Sockeye Recovery Plan Presentation” and “Kline – 11-12-14 NOAA Coordination Talk.”
- The 60-day comment period has closed. Comments have been consolidated and Rosemary will be working with the Sockeye Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) team to address and, if appropriate, incorporate as edits to the Plan. (***Post-meeting note:** the TAC met on November 13 and began reviewing and addressing the comments received.*)

**Steelhead / SS Chinook** (Rosemary Furfey):

- Please refer to PowerPoint presentation, “Furfey - SS Chinook and Steelhead pres SRCG mtg 12 Nov 2014.”

SUBJECT: Coordination Group Meeting Notes: 11-12-14

- This recovery plan differs from the other two in that it involves large numbers of populations.
- Rich Carmichael noted that the plan defers to hatchery genetic management plans (HGMPs), yet population-level hatchery related limiting factors and recovery actions are difficult to define for those populations located where HGMPs await NMFS approval.
- Regarding the ESU/DPS Roll-up Plan, there was discussion of the need to prioritize those actions that could benefit multiple ESUs and DPSs basin-wide.

**Hydro & Ocean Modules** (Paul Wagner / Kurt Fresh):

- Please refer to the draft Hydro and Ocean Modules posted to NOAA's Snake River Recovery Plans website.
- Paul noted that the Hydro Module was updated to reflect the 2014 BiOp data for current survival and conversion rates.
  - Juvenile survival rates are in the range of expectations.
  - Adult conversion rates are less than expected.
- Transport rates projected under the 2008 BiOp were in the range of 60-90% for spring migrants. However, the actual rates have been in the range of 30-50%, less than the BiOp's assumption. These numbers do not differentiate between natural and hatchery fish.
- The Ocean Module includes information on how fish are using the estuary as well, in order to present a more complete picture.
- Rosemary noted that the four modules (Hydro, Ocean, Estuary, and Harvest) will remain the same for the Snake River Sockeye, Fall Chinook, and Steelhead/SS Chinook Recovery Plans. NOAA will accept comments on the modules with each proposed recovery plan release. Changes to the modules will not be adopted until comments on all three draft plans are received and addressed.
- The question was asked whether NOAA intended to call for actions in the hydrosystem in addition to those identified in the BiOp. The draft plans identify uncertainties and the research and monitoring actions needed to address those uncertainties. Additional actions may be appropriate depending on the findings of those research and monitoring efforts.

**SE Washington Management Unit Plan** (Steve Martin):

- Please refer to PowerPoint presentation, "Martin – SE Washington Snake River Salmon Recovery Board."
- Steve noted that drone camera technology has captured many of the restoration projects, including the large wood restoration on the Tucannon. Click here to view: <http://snakeriverboard.org/wpi/library/videos/> .

**Northeast Oregon Management Unit Plan** (Adrienne Averett / Renee Coxen):

SUBJECT: Coordination Group Meeting Notes: 11-12-14

- Please refer to PowerPoint presentation, “Averett – Snake River Coordination Meeting Final.”
- Rich Carmichael noted his view that federal plans lack adequate analysis that demonstrate that recovery actions are likely to lead to the desired results.
- The Oregon Chapter of the American Fisheries Society will be presenting a two-day Hatchery vs. Wild Salmonid Symposium on January 22-23, 2015. Click here for more information: <http://orafs.org/hatchery-vs-wild-salmonid-symposium-research-management-and-reform-in-the-pacific-northwest/>

**Idaho Management Unit Plan** (Mike Edmondson):

- Please refer to PowerPoint presentations, “Edmondson – 2007-072-00 Accord History” and “Edmondson – Potlatch Accord Information.”
- Mike focused on Lemhi restoration projects, but provided a handout, which includes similar information on projects in the Potlatch River Watershed (included in post-meeting materials).

**Wrap Up** (Rick Mogren):

- The following are some of the closing thoughts/questions of attendees:
  - How does the Fall Chinook Plan inform SS Chinook recovery?
  - Uncertainty criteria should be developed for the Snake River ESUs/DPSs, MPGs, and associated populations.
  - Given that Snake River Recovery work has been a decade-long project, there should not be a rush to finish at the expense of getting it right. Specifically, the state salmon managers would like sufficient time to review and comment on the draft Fall Chinook Recovery Plan as has been provided to the tribal salmon managers.

**Attachments:**

Snake River Coordination Group Attendance List and Contact Information

Attachment 1

**SNAKE RIVER COORDINATION GROUP  
ATTENDANCE LIST AND CONTACT INFORMATION**

Shown Alphabetically by Name

<b>PRESENT</b>	<b>NAME</b>		<b>AFFILIATION</b>	<b>EMAIL</b>
yes	Austin	Bob	USRTF	bob@usrtf.org
yes	Averett	Adrienne	ODFW	Adrienne.W.Averett@state.or.us
phone	Bagdovitz	Mark	USFWS	Mark_Bagdovitz@fws.gov
yes	Bowler	Bert	SR Salmon Solutions	bbowler@snakeriversalmonsolutions.org
yes	Broncho	Claudeo	Shoshone-Bannock Tribe	cbroncho@shoshonebannocktribes.com
phone	Busack	Craig	NOAA	craig.busack@noaa.gov
yes	Carmichael	Rich	ODFW	richard.w.carmichael@state.or.us
phone	Clark	Greg	USGS	gmclark@usgs.gov
phone	Cooney	Tom	NOAA	tom.cooney@noaa.gov
phone	Coxen	Renee	NOAA	renee.coxen@noaa.gov
yes	Edmondson	Mike	Idaho Governor's Office	mike.edmondson@osc.idaho.gov
yes	Fesenmyer	Sarah	NOAA	sarah.fesenmyer@noaa.gov
yes	Furfey	Rosemary	NOAA	rosemary.furfey@noaa.gov
yes	Gaar	Elizabeth	NOAA	elizabeth.gaar@noaa.gov
yes	Griswold	Robert		robertgriswold@gmail.com
yes	Groat	Del	SR Salmon Recovery Board	SRSRB
yes	Hassemer	Pete	IDFG	pete.hassemer@idfg.idaho.gov
yes	Hesse	Jay	Nez Perce	jayh@nezperce.org
phone	Jule	Kristen	BPA	krjule@bpa.gov
yes	Kline	Paul	IDFG	paul.kline@idfg.idaho.gov
yes	Kraker	Joe	USFWS	joe_kraker@fws.gov
yes	Mabe	David	NOAA	david.mabe@noaa.gov
yes	Martin	Steve	SR Salmon Recovery Board	steve@snakeriverboard.org
phone	Mazaika	Rosy	BPA	rxmazaika@bpa.gov
yes	Mitchell	Brenda	USFS	brendalmitchell@fs.fed.us

SUBJECT: Coordination Group Meeting Notes: 11-12-14

<b>PRESENT</b>	<b>NAME</b>		<b>AFFILIATION</b>	<b>EMAIL</b>
yes	Mogren	Rick	Federal Caucus	Rick.Mogren@noaa.gov
yes	Robinson	Laura	NPCC	lrobinson@nwcouncil.org
yes	Schifferdecker	Nancy	Federal Caucus	nancy.schifferdecker@noaa.gov
yes	Shutters	Marvin	USACE	marvin.k.shutters@usace.army.mil
yes	Stuart	Tom		<a href="mailto:tomstuart@cableone.net">tomstuart@cableone.net</a>
yes	Taki	Doug	Shoshone-Bannock Tribe	dtaki@sbtribes.com
yes	Tardy	Kurt	Shoshone-Bannock Tribe	ktardy@sbtribes.com
yes	Thurow	Russ	USFS	rthurow@fs.fed.us
phone	Ulmer	Linda	USFS	lulmer@fs.fed.us
yes	Whalen	John	WDFW	john.whalen@dfw.wa.gov
phone	Woltering	Scott	USFS	swoltering@fs.fed.us