

Comments

I have provided comments on both the **Status Review Report** and the **ASSESSMENT OF EXTINCTION RISK** parts of the documentation.

The reports are thorough and generally well written. There are no major deficiencies in terms of data and descriptive information relating to status. There are some relatively minor issues that need to be addressed and all of these are referenced as “track changes” throughout the documents.

Response to specific points:

1. The accuracy, quality, and completeness of the data considered, particularly if any additional data exist that were not considered.

Map and geographic description of the species needs to be revised to include areas missed, namely Davis Strait throughout (based on Canadian surveys carried out since 2009), Barents Sea throughout, White Sea. (see the COSEWIC doc Fig. 2) and the western part of the Baltic Sea (Compagno et al.) The Fisbase map (see COSEWIC report) is more accurate than the Redlist map in this case.

2. Whether uncertainties in the data are reasonably identified and characterized.

There are inconsistencies and reduced clarity in the discussion of DPS, population or species, at the beginning of the report. It is important to determine and explicitly indicate what entity is being assessed. Some revised wording required particularly at the start. Generation time needs to be clarified as 2 numbers are given, one without supporting documentation.

3. If you believe that information is missing, justification for a statement is lacking, or specific information was applied incorrectly in reaching conclusions, please be specific in your comments.

See comments throughout the text.

“...the ERA team evaluated extinction risk rangewide for thorny skate.”. Skate are declared as a single DPS; potential for intermixing between the east and west Atlantic is assumed, not demonstrated. It should be demonstrated that distance and depth in the middle are not a barrier and determined whether the NW/NE distribution is broken or continuous. If unknown then there is uncertainty whether it is a single DPS.